

The Rise of Religion and the Future of Capitalism

Peter S. Heslam

The rise of religion and the rise of capitalism are currently occurring in roughly the same geographical regions (Latin America, Asia, and Africa). Although both religion and capitalism are often ignored, or are regarded negatively, within development circles, this article reflects on their potential for human wellbeing when they converge. Its focus is on the socio-economic significance of what the author calls the Evangelical Pentecostal Charismatic Movement (EPCM), which accounts for most of the growth of Christianity, the world's largest religion. He argues that the movement's stimulation of self-empowerment (especially of women), church-based social outreach, and the encouragement of trust are of particular significance. They provide ample grounds, he contends, for revisiting the question Max Weber is famous for having posed about the link between religious belief and economic behaviour. They also help overcome victimhood mentalities and promote good stewardship, accountability and integrity. The EPCM thereby acts as a progressive force that, in serving the common good, stands to make a positive contribution to the future of capitalism.

One of the futures of capitalism reflects one of its pasts: it will be driven and shaped by religious belief. The context for this claim is a world in which the areas experiencing the rise of entrepreneurial capitalism roughly correspond to those experiencing the rise of religion. This observation recalls the work of the German academic Max Weber (1864-1920), generally regarded as the chief founder of sociology. While the focus of his most famous book was on the rise of Protestantism and capitalism in the premodern West, a similar concurrence characterizes the contemporary Global South.¹ The largest of the growing religions in that hemisphere is Christianity and the movement within Christianity that accounts for most of its growth is generally called Pentecostalism but can more accurately be called the Evangelical Pentecostal Charismatic Movement (EPCM). This term takes into account the movement's multiple manifestations in mainstream denominational churches that do not describe themselves as Pentecostal but embrace some of its key traits. Using the term EPCM as an interchangeable substitute for

¹ Max Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1930 [1905]).

Pentecostalism, this article will, therefore, provide a brief exploration of the EPCM's potential to help provide the conditions necessary for economic development.

This is a future of capitalism that has been largely overlooked, despite its importance for human and environmental wellbeing. Both religion and entrepreneurial capitalism tend to be regarded more as problem-creators, rather than as potential problem-solvers, in contemporary society and culture. Against this background, it is perhaps not surprising that the socio-economic roles of religion and entrepreneurship are virtually ignored in mainstream development thinking. This is reflected, for example, in a book on fifty key thinkers on development edited by the development expert David Simon,² and in the best-selling works of renowned development economists including Jeffrey Sachs, Joseph Stiglitz, William Easterly, Jagdish Bhagwati, Amartya Sen, and Paul Collier.³ The irony of this situation is that it is particularly in the so-called developing world that the potential of these roles for human well-being is most evident, especially when they converge.

Elsewhere I have argued that this positive potential can be seen in the EPCM's encouragement of future-mindedness, a sense of calling, the deferral of gratification, entrepreneurship, rationalization, and voluntary association.⁴ Here I plan to highlight three additional factors of similar importance: self-empowerment (especially of women), church-based social outreach, and the encouragement of trust. A fuller treatment, which lies outside the scope of this short article, would need to grapple with two further key questions that are inter-related and reflect Weber's legacy. First, will the EPCM and its associated virtues inevitably lose their influence on the development of capitalism over time? Second, can there be any 'functional equivalents' to the EPCM in terms of economic impact – could some other worldview-based movement (religious or secular) stand in its stead? I hope to return to these two questions in a subsequent publication. In the current paper I aim to demonstrate that, although often neglected or denied, there are well-founded reasons why the EPCM's positive potential for human development warrants sustained attention.

This does not absolve the movement from ways in which it can hamper development, such as those associated with the excesses of the 'prosperity gospel'. These excesses have attracted much interest, and have gained such prominence in the study of the movement, that the words 'pentecostal' and 'prosperity' have become virtually

² *Fifty Key Thinkers on Development*, edited by David Simon (Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2006). Simon's selection does include the Hindu Mahatma Gandhi and the Buddhist A.T. Ariyaratne but their religious beliefs are pushed to one side. The reader is told that 'Ariyaratne was well aware that religion, in its institutional form, historically has not played a progressive role in the material transformation of society' (p. 28).

³ Jeffrey Sachs, *The End of Poverty: How We Can Make it Happen in Our Lifetime* (London: Penguin, 2005); Joseph Stiglitz, *Making Globalization Work: The Next Steps to Global Justice* (London: Allen Lane, 2006); William Easterly, *The White Man's Burden: Why the West's Efforts to Aid the Rest Have Done so Much Ill and so Little Good* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006); Jagdish Bhagwati, *In Defence of Globalization* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004); Amartya Sen, *Development as Freedom* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999); Paul Collier, *The Bottom Billion: Why the Poorest Countries are Failing and What Can be Done About It* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).

⁴ Peter S. Heslam, 'Christianity and the Prospects for Development in the Global South', in *The Oxford Handbook of Christianity and Economics*, edited by Paul Oslington (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), pp. 359-383.

inseparable for many commentators. This only increases the marginalization of faith and entrepreneurship amongst development thinkers. Yet however accurately the pentecostal-prosperity association reflects reality in certain localities, this cannot be taken as the full picture. That picture contains elements that are significant to development, of which the three highlighted in this article are examples.

Outlining these elements challenges not only the neglect of entrepreneurship and religion in development studies but also of entrepreneurship and development in religious studies. Due to its religious and economic ramifications, the EPCM is significant to both disciplines. If Dena Freeman is right in her assertion that 'the practice and discipline of development was founded on the belief that religion was not important to development processes', what follows should provide some basis - however preliminary and rudimentary - for challenging that belief.⁵ It should also provide sufficient evidence that any reflection on the futures of capitalism (such as this journal edition undertakes) cannot ignore the development potential of the EPCM. This movement has around 600 million adherents and is gaining over nine million new members per year (more than 25,000 per day), the overwhelming majority of whom are located in low- and middle-income countries.⁶ If Dena Freeman is also correct in asserting that 'there is a marked lack of in-depth anthropological work that applies Weber's ideas to contemporary Protestantism', this article may provide some basic rationale as to why that work would be worthwhile.⁷ Likewise, if Rijk van Dijk is right that 'in much of the so-called post-development literature there is little recognition of the importance of religion', this article should at least offer some new lines of enquiry.⁸

⁵ Dena Freeman, 'The Pentecostal Ethic and the Spirit of Development', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*, edited by Dena Freeman (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), pp. 1-38, at p. 1. See also on this point Severine Deneulin and Carol Rakodi, 'Revisiting Religion: Development Studies Thirty Years On', *World Development* 39:1 (2011), pp. 45-54, at p. 46, and Severine Deneulin, *Religion in Development: Rewriting the Secular Script* (London: Zed, 2009), *passim*; Emma Tomalin, 'Faiths and Development', in *The Companion to Development Studies*, edited by Vandana Desai and Robert Potter (London: Hodder Arnold, 2008), pp. 485-489; Leah Selinger, 'The Forgotten Factor: The Uneasy Relationship between Religion and Development', *Social Compass* 51:4 (2004), pp. 523-543.

⁶ Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life, *Global Christianity: A Report on the Size and Distribution of the World's Christian Population* (Washington, DC: Pew Forum, 2011). The distinguished anthropologist and scholar of religion Jean Comaroff cites a figure of twenty million new members per day but does not note her source (Jean Comaroff, 'Pentecostalism, Populism and the New Politics of Affect', in Freeman, *Pentecostalism*, pp. 41-66, at p. 48).

⁷ Freeman, 'The Pentecostal Ethic', p. 17.

⁸ Rijk van Dijk, 'Pentecostalism and Post-Development: Exploring Religion as a Developmental Ideology in Ghanaian Migrant Communities', in Freeman, *Pentecostalism*, pp. 87-108, at p. 89. Post-development is essentially an attempt to understand low-income and emerging economies that avoids using the Western bourgeois values considered inherent in the notion of 'development'. Arguably, therefore, it is more a critical theory than an ideological concept as such. Amongst post-developmentalists, development is often regarded as a Western 'religion'. See *Exploring Post-Development: Theory and Practice, Problems and Perspectives*, edited by Aram Ziai (London: Routledge, 2007).

Self-empowerment

The experience of emerging economies over recent decades seems to indicate that the most effective solutions to poverty emerge from the bottom-up, within local communities. International aid can help and plays a vital role in acute cases of human need brought about by calamitous events such as floods and earthquakes. In many developing contexts, however, international aid has dampened the creative initiative of the people it was designed to help. When diverted into rent-seeking behaviour or into the accounts of corrupt government officials, it has discouraged personal effort and has allowed a sense of incapacity and dependency to dominate domestic policy.⁹ The challenge for the poor in such situations is to find the confidence, initiative and sources of self-help to be able to fend for themselves. This reflects the fact that wide-scale and sustainable economic uplift happens only where there is evidence that the 'factors of production' include the kind of qualities Weber referred to as the Protestant ethic - initiative, hard work, honesty, thrift, tenacity, productivity and a sense of ownership and responsibility. When these are embedded in grassroots but scalable entrepreneurial endeavour, the impact on human development can be profound.¹⁰

All this suggests that people the world over are dignified and creative beings with great potential and that the most effective form of empowerment is self-empowerment. In contexts in which they appear to lack the capacity for work hard or the initiative to create new wealth, the fault often lies with corrupt regimes or misguided aid programmes.¹¹ Whereas top-down approaches tend to patronize, the more egalitarian and meritocratic forms of empowerment that EPCM churches generally foster show

⁹ John Shao, 'Alleviating Poverty in Africa', in *Faith in Development: Partnership between the World Bank and the Churches of Africa*, edited by Deryke Belshaw, Robert Calderisi and Chris Sugden (Oxford: Regnum, 2001), pp. 19-30, at p. 27; Daryl Balia, *Make Corruption History* (London: SPCK, 2009); Easterly; Robert Calderisi, *The Trouble with Africa: Why Foreign Aid Isn't Working* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007); Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', pp. 1-9; Roger C. Riddell, *Does Foreign Aid Really Work?* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008).

¹⁰ Peter S. Heslam, 'Happiness Through Thrift: The Contribution of Business to Human Wellbeing', in *The Practices of Happiness: Political Economy, Religion, and Wellbeing*, edited by John Atherton, Elaine Graham and Ian Steedman (London: Routledge, 2011), pp. 54-65; Peter S. Heslam, *Transforming Capitalism: Entrepreneurship and the Renewal of Thrift* (Cambridge: Grove, 2011); Peter S. Heslam and Eric Wood, 'Faith and Business Practice Amongst Christian Entrepreneurs in Developing and Emerging Markets', *Koers - Bulletin for Christian Scholarship* 79:2 (2014), available online at <http://www.journals.koers.aosis.co.za/index.php/koers/article/viewFile/2131/2464> (accessed 2016-01-19); Ann Bernstein and Stephen Rule, 'Flying under South Africa's Radar: The Growth and Impact of Pentecostals in a Developing Country', in *The Hidden Form of Capital: Spiritual Influences in Societal Progress*, edited by Peter Berger and Gordon Redding (London: Anthem, 2011), pp. 91-131; Amy Sherman, *The Soul of Development: Biblical Christianity and Economic Transformation in Guatemala* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997); Dean Karlan and Jabob Appel, *More Than Good Intentions: Improving the Ways the World's Poor Borrow, Save, Farm, Learn, and Stay Healthy* (New York: Penguin, 2011); Rijk van Dijk, 'Pentecostalism and Post-Development', pp. 96-104.

¹¹ Deepa Narayan, 'Voices of the Poor', in *Faith in Development: Partnership between the World Bank and the Churches of Africa*, edited by Deryke Belshaw, Robert Calderisi and Chris Sugden (Oxford: Regnum, 2001), pp. 39-48; Riddell; Dambisa Moyo, *Dead Aid: Destroying the Biggest Global Myth of Our Time* (London: Allen Lane, 2008).

greater effectiveness at tackling poverty. Their deeply subversive teaching that all human beings enjoy dignity, equality and creativity by being made in the image of God stimulates a shift from victim to victor mentalities, and from fatalistic attitudes to a sense of agency and divine approbation. This helps to remove the cultural constraints to self-improvement and innovation and encourage a commitment to human rights that can translate into institutional and democratic changes that facilitate economic development. This is what makes the EPCM not only the largest and fastest-growing religious movement in history but also one of history's most effective self-help movements.¹²

Women are crucial to this effectiveness. David Martin goes as far as to claim that Evangelical Christianity 'in all its forms' is attractive to women as a safe sanctuary where they can express themselves in a context of dignity and respect that stands in sharp contrast to surrounding macho cultures.¹³ He notes 'the space it [Pentecostalism] creates for mutuality within the home in spite of patriarchal characteristics'.¹⁴ Similar points are made by other sociologists. Peter Berger writes that Pentecostalism 'dismantles the *compadre* system ... and indeed is in many ways a women's movement'.¹⁵ Likewise, Mike Davis suggests that it represents such a powerful pro-poor movement because it appeals in particular to slum-dwelling women and concedes a larger role to women than other types of Christianity.¹⁶ In her study of 'gendered transformation' in Kenya, Damaris Parsitau notes that 'today one of the most striking features of the Kenyan Pentecostal scene is its increasingly feminised face'. She highlights 'a proliferation of ordained female clergy' and argues that women-led Pentecostal and Charismatic churches have been central in the transformation of gender relations in that country and have led to the increased equality and empowerment of women.¹⁷

¹² Lawrence Schlemmer, *Dormant Capital: The Pentecostal Movement in South Africa and its Potential Social and Economic Role* (Johannesburg: Centre for Development and Enterprise, 2008); Sherman; Peter S. Heslam, 'The Role of Business in the Fight Against Poverty', in *Christian Theology and Market Economics*, edited by Ian R. Harper and Samuel Gregg (Cheltenham: Edward Elgar, 2008), pp. 164-180; Andreas Widmer, 'Ministering to the Pioneers of Prosperity', in *Free Markets and the Culture of the Common Good*, edited by Martin Schlag and Juan Andrés Mercado (London: Springer, 2012), pp. 167-176; Paul Freston, 'Pentecostals and Politics in Latin America', in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant and Richard Flory (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 101-118, at p. 111.

¹³ David Martin, *On Secularization: Towards a Revised General Theory* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005), p. 42.

¹⁴ David Martin, *The Future of Christianity: Reflections on Violence and Democracy, Religion and Secularization* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011), p. 75.

¹⁵ Peter Berger, 'Max Weber is alive and well and living in Guatemala'. Paper prepared for the conference 'The Norms, Beliefs and Institutions of the Twenty-First Century' at Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, 8-9 October 2004, pp. 4-5. Berger's point reflects the research findings of Elizabeth Brusco in her *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Columbia* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995).

¹⁶ Mike Davis, 'Planet of Slums: Urban Involution and the Informal Proletariat', *New Left Review* 26 (2004), pp. 5-34, at p. 32).

¹⁷ Damaris Parsitau, 'Agents of Gendered Change: Empowerment, Salvation and Gendered Transformation in Urban Kenya', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*, edited by Dena Freeman (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), pp. 203-221, at pp. 203 and 210.

There are many other reasons, besides greater access to the pastorate, why the EPCM's significance for women is crucial to development. These include the emphasis on bible study, which provides a powerful stimulus for literacy amongst women and girls who suffer unequal access to education. Even in churches that exclude women from senior leadership positions, the importance of men exercising service and accountability in the pastoral oversight they exercise is often emphasized. In many domestic contexts, women are not only the chief providers for their families but the chief decision makers and supervisors when it comes to their children's health and educational needs. These factors partly explain the wide consensus amongst development practitioners that the most effective strategies to alleviate poverty are those focused on girls and women. This applies across the board, not specifically to the EPCM, but the movement's encouragement amongst men of courtesy and respect for women, of love and faithfulness within marriage, of involvement in the provision, care and nurture of children, of moderation or abstinence in the consumption of alcohol, of good 'housekeeping' with regard to spending and saving, and of the renunciation of drugs and promiscuity, are norms that have distinct advantages for women.¹⁸ While pastors of large churches can resemble the Big Men and Big Women characteristic of some traditional cultures, in general the EPCM represents a genuine revision of gender roles in favour of mutual respect and dignity.¹⁹ Amy Sherman concludes from her research into the economic impact of the EPCM that its primary impact is domestic: 'transformations in family life are the most immediately evident manifestations of conversion'.²⁰ Amongst both religious and secular movements, the EPCM stands out for demanding and legitimizing radical behavioural change, which in turn has significant impact on families, communities, and social relations.²¹ The dividends for development are reflected in the fact that amongst churches in developing countries, those belonging to the EPCM show the highest rates of literacy and upward social mobility. This in part reflects the fact that sexual abstinence amongst young single EPCM adherents contributes to higher educational attainment, especially amongst women.²²

¹⁸ Bernice Martin, 'The Pentecostal Gender Paradox: A Cautionary Tale for the Sociology of Religion', in *The Blackwell Companion to the Sociology of Religion*, edited by Richard Fenn (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), pp. 52-66; Kristina Helgesson, *'Walking in the Spirit': The Complexity of Belonging in Two Pentecostal Churches in Durban, South Africa* (Uppsala: Elanders, 2006); Abhijit V. Banerjee and Esther Duflo, *Poor Economics: Barefoot Hedge-fund Managers, DIY Doctors and the Surprising Truth about Life on Less than \$1 a Day* (London: Penguin, 2011), pp. 251-273; David Maxwell, "'Delivered from the Spirit of Poverty": Pentecostalism, Prosperity and Modernity in Zimbabwe', *Journal of Religion in Africa* 28:3 (1998), pp. 350-373; Rijk van Dijk, 'Religion, Reciprocity and Restructuring Family Responsibility in the Ghanaian Pentecostal Diaspora', in *The Transnational Family: New European Frontiers and Global Networks*, edited by Deborah Bryceson and Ulla Vuorela (Oxford: Berg, 2002), pp. 173-196.

¹⁹ Jane Soothill, *Gender, Social Change and Spiritual Power: Charismatic Christianity in Ghana* (Leiden: Brill, 2007).

²⁰ Sherman, p. 114. See also Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', p. 3.

²¹ Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', pp. 13-14.

²² Bernstein and Rule; Schlemmer, p. 75; Sherman, p. 89. The development potential of the EPCM is reflected in Ruth Marshall's finding that employers in Africa often prefer to recruit 'born-again' people, whether or not they share their faith. See her 'Power in the Name of Jesus', *Review of African Political Economy* 52 (1991), pp. 21-37, at p. 29).

Charitable Initiatives

While the positivity associated with the EPCM vision of human dignity serves to inspire the solution-oriented mindsets associated with commercial entrepreneurship, it also helps stimulate not-for-profit enterprises and charitable initiatives aimed at tackling poverty. Self-help leads to mutual help as EPCM organizations refuse to be undone by the scale of poverty and reject the idea that meeting its challenges should be left to governments.²³ While the resulting initiatives are often unashamedly faith-based, they generally avoid being faith-biased. They take, in other words, an inclusive approach, seeking to meet the needs of believers and unbelievers alike. This reflects a mindset that is guided by 'a strong sense of there being no sharp line between the sacred and the secular'.²⁴ It also reflects patterns uncovered in research in the United States which demonstrate that religion makes a disproportionate contribution to 'secular' civil society and that it helps address a wide range of social ills. It also increases well-being, educational attainment, self-esteem, optimism and a sense of hope.²⁵ In so doing, the EPCM helps to broaden notions of solidarity and social responsibility, thereby expanding the radius of trust – a point that will be returned to later in this article.

Research into the social outreach of indigenous religious organizations in developing countries is still in its infancy and it struggles to keep up with the spawning initiatives in this field. One of the most significant studies is that by Miller and Yamamori.²⁶ After stipulating that a key selection criteria for their study of churches was that they needed to have active social outreach programmes, these researchers were astonished to find that nearly 85 percent of qualifying churches were Pentecostal or charismatic. Once the study completed in 2007, they concluded that such churches are running 'some of the most innovative social programmes in the world'. They conceded

²³ Martin, *The Future of Christianity*, p. 70.

²⁴ Norman Long, 'Foreword', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*, edited by Dena Freeman (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), pp. vii-x, at p. viii. See also Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', p. 2.

²⁵ Andrew Greeley, 'Coleman Revisited: Religious Structures as a Source of Social Capital', *American Behavioral Scientist* 40:5 (1997), pp. 587-594; Robert Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2000); Kathleen Brennan and Andrew London, 'Are Religious People Nice People? Religiosity, Race, Interview Dynamics and Perceived Cooperativeness', *Sociological Inquiry* 71:2 (2001), pp. 129-144; Pui-Yan Lam, 'As the Flocks Gather: How Religion Affects Voluntary Association Participation', *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 41:3 (2002), pp. 405-422; *Religion as Social Capital: Producing the Common Good*, edited by Corwin Smidt (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2003); Wendy Cadge and Robert Wuthnow, 'Religion and the Non-Profit Sector', in *The Nonprofit Sector: A Research Handbook*, 2nd edition, edited by Walter Powell and Richard Steinberg (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2006), pp. 485-505; Bryon Johnson, Ralph Tompkins and Derek Webb, *Objective Hope: Assessing the Effectiveness of Faith-Based Organizations: A Review of the Literature* (Waco, TX: Baylor Institute for Studies of Religion, 2008); Robert Putnam and David Campbell, *American Grace: How Religion Divides and Unites Us* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010).

²⁶ Donald Miller and Tetsunao Yamamori, *Global Pentecostalism: The New Face of Christian Social Engagement* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007).

that while Liberation Theology had opted for the poor, the poor had opted for Pentecostalism, which in turn had become the new face of Christian social engagement.²⁷

This 'socializing' of the EPCM has come about largely through developments associated with increasing prosperity: greater upward mobility; a heightened sense of civic responsibility; a more 'integral' or 'holistic' theology that stresses the social implications of the gospel; and a view of personhood that encompasses body, mind and spirit. The multiple initiatives that embody such developments include not only the establishment of care centres for orphans, widows, drug addicts, and the infirm, but micro-enterprise loans and job training that go beyond relief to address the need for economic development and systemic social change. This reflects the appeal of the EPCM to profound human desires for meaning and purpose, and its ability to stimulate the pursuit of social justice through expressions of unconditional love and sacrificial service. As it does so, it is not uncommon for non-EPCM churches, including Anglican and Roman Catholic ones, to join forces with EPCM churches in local initiatives and partnerships. Leaders of these more traditional communities often bring to such projects valuable institutional expertise and find in their EPCM partners a form of liberation theology quite unlike the sort with which they are familiar but which is nonetheless radical, progressive, practical, and (especially for women) liberational. The upshot is often that conventional programmes focusing on the relief of symptoms are supplemented by initiatives oriented around self-help that provide people in poverty with a hand-up, rather than a hand-out.²⁸

Trust

Notwithstanding the prevailing intellectual blind spot towards the development potential of religion alluded to at the start of this article, research has begun to demonstrate a positive correlation between religious belief and socio-economic wellbeing. Beliefs concerning the afterlife – especially about heaven and hell – are particularly important for their capacity to incentivize the hard work, ethical conduct and thrift that result in mutual trust and openness to strangers. Such trust has been found to be particularly high amongst Protestants and to be crucial to the workings of modern capitalism. This is especially true in the development of efficient credit networks, possibly reflecting the roots of the word credit in the Latin *credo* – 'I believe'. Indeed, several scholars have shown that beliefs that compound and expand the radius of trust

²⁷ Miller & Yamamori, pp. 6, 12, 212; Donald Miller, 'Introduction: Pentecostalism as a Global Phenomenon', in *Spirit and Power*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant and Richard Flory (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 1-19, at p. 3.

²⁸ Steve Corbett and Brian Fikkert, *When Helping Hurts: Alleviating Poverty Without Hurting the Poor and Yourself* (Chicago: Moody Press, 2009); *For the Least of These: A Biblical Answer to Poverty*, edited by Anne Bradley and Art Lindsay (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2015); Matthew Bishop and Michael Green, *Philanthrocapitalism: How Giving Can Save the World* (London: A&C Black, 2010); Nanak Kakwani and Jacques Silber (eds.), *The Many Dimensions of Poverty* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007); Danny McCain, 'The Metamorphosis of Nigerian Pentecostalism: From Signs and Wonders in the Church to Service and Influence in the World', in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant and Richard Flory (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 160-181.

increase the prospects for social, economic and political development. As the kind of strict ethical codes that religion encourages demand honesty and self-control, they thereby promote trustworthiness and a respect for law, both of which facilitate market exchanges and the extension of credit.²⁹

Where, on the other hand, the radius of trust is restricted, social and economic polarization, conflict and autocratic government are commonplace. In such contexts, hierarchical worldviews are invigorated, allowing paternalism, patron-client relationships, rent-seeking activity and social rigidity to tighten their grip. Both private and public spheres become more centralized, burdened with bureaucratic mechanisms. These tend to become yet more bureaucratic when they prove ineffective in curbing dishonesty. As trust is restricted to family and kin, suspicion and hostility grow towards outsiders and resources are diverted away from productive investment. Little incentive is left for the kind of initiative, innovation, risk-taking, hard work, social engagement, and community organization that the EPCM has proved so effective in stimulating.³⁰

Lack of trust from the intended beneficiaries of 'development' has dogged the humanitarian efforts of governments, international finance institutions (IFIs) and secular NGOs for decades. While many government projects have failed due to corruption on the part of their operators, projects run by IFIs and NGOs have turned out to be ill-founded, culturally insensitive, or unsustainable. Many times it is a case of external agendas imposed by outsiders with little local knowledge.³¹

²⁹ Robert J. Barro and Rachel M. McCleary, 'Religion and Economic Growth across Countries', *American Sociological Review* (2003), pp. 760-781; Luigi Guiso, Paola Sapienza and Luigi Zingales, "'People's Opium?' Religion and Economic Attitudes', *Journal of Monetary Economics* 50 (2003), pp. 225-282; Horst Feldmann, 'Protestantism, Labor Force Participation, and Employment Across Countries', *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 66:4 (2007), pp. 795-816; Milan Zafirovski, *Exchange, Action, and Social Structure: Elements of Economic Sociology* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 2001), pp. 112-119; Robin Grier, 'The Effect of Religion on Economic Development: A Cross National Study of 63 Former Colonies', *Kyklos* 50:1, pp. 47-61; Andrew Henley, 'Is Religion Associated with Entrepreneurial Activity?', IZA Discussion Paper No. 8111 (April 2014), available online at <http://ftp.iza.org/dp8111.pdf> (accessed 2016-01-19); Paul Freston, pp. 106-109. For a critique of the view that religion in general, or any specific form of it, influences economic behaviour, see Eelke de Jong, 'Religious Values and Economic Growth: A Review and Assessment of Recent Studies', Working Paper 08-111, November 2008 (Nijmegen Center for Economics, Institute for Management Research, Radboud University Nijmegen);

³⁰ Lawrence Harrison, *Who Prospers? How Cultural Values Shape Economic and Political Success* (New York: Basic Books, 1992); Francis Fukuyama, *Trust: The Social Virtues and the Creation of Prosperity* (New York: Free Press, 1995); Stephen Knack and Philip Keefer, 'Does Social Capital Have an Economic Payoff? A Cross-Country Investigation', *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 112 (1997), pp. 1251-1288; World Economic Forum, *Results of the Survey on Trust* (Davos: World Economic Forum, 2002); Peter S. Heslam, Michael G. Pollitt and Ian W. Jones, *How a Social Capital Approach Can Help Multinationals to Show Ethical Leadership*, Working Paper 388, Cambridge: Centre for Business Research, University of Cambridge, 2009; Peter Berger, *Faith and Development: A Global Perspective*, public lecture delivered at the Centre for Development and Enterprise (CDE) in Johannesburg, available online at http://www.cde.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2013/02/Faith_and_Development.pdf (accessed 2016-01-19); Berger, 'Max Weber'; Schlemmer, p. 75; Sherman, p. 89.

³¹ Collier; Barry Asmus and Wayne Grudem, *The Poverty of Nations: A Sustainable Solution* (Wheaton: Crossway, 2013); Sachs; Riddell; Alex Perry, *The Rift: A New Africa Breaks Free* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 2015); Banerjee and Duflo; Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', pp. 24-26.

EPCM churches, in contrast, are generally institutions with deep roots in the community, even when they belong to networks with foreign origins. This puts them in a strong position to effect long-term social change, especially when such change involves confrontation, such as in the case of churches actively fighting autocracy, bribery, and exploitative economic activity. It is only because of the trust EPCM churches enjoy that they are able to be effective in the development-orientated social ministries that increasingly characterize their operations. Such churches can be found in regions many NGOs are unable to penetrate, such as remote rural locations and areas of armed conflict.³² An example is the violent insurgency in recent decades in parts of Uganda, especially in the north, where the EPCM's strong moral framework has provided order and stability to many displaced people.³³

Secular IFIs, NGOs and other international organizations increasingly recognize the potential this represents. UN agencies, for instance, have recognized that religious NGOs (many of the largest of which are EPCM organizations) not only command high levels of trust but have access to valuable resources, including large numbers of committed volunteers and one of the most credible, widespread and locally-rooted distribution systems in the world. This is reflected in their reputation to be the first to arrive and the last to depart in disaster relief situations. Leaving aside the contribution religious people have been shown to make to secular organizations, the World Bank estimates that half of all health and education services in sub-Saharan Africa are provided by religious organizations.³⁴

The service culture of the EPCM is not restricted to healthcare and education, the two spheres traditionally championed in Christian social outreach. It pervades a variety of workplaces, including political, legal and commercial environments in which corruption is rife. Some of these workplaces are provided directly by EPCM churches running their own businesses in such sectors as media, sport and leisure, information technology, advertising and financial services. But whether or not churches run their own business, they often offer courses and advisory services on practical issues such as budgeting, time-management and goal-setting, led by experts from within their own congregations. Such initiatives are often complemented by work experience schemes,

³² Monica Duffy Toft, Daniel Philpott and Timothy Samuel Shah, *God's Century: Resurgent Religion and Global Politics* (New York: Norton, 2001); Brian J. Grim and Roger Finke, *The Price of Freedom Denied: Religious Persecution and Conflict in the Twenty-First Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011); Michael Taylor, *Not Angels but Agencies: The Ecumenical Response to Poverty* (London: SCM, 2011); Katherine Marshall and Marisa Van Saanen, *Development and Faith: Where Mind, Heart, and Soul Work Together* (Washington: World Bank, 2007).

³³ Ben Jones, 'Pentecostalism, Development NGOs and Meaning in Eastern Uganda', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*, edited by Dena Freeman (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), pp. 181-202.

³⁴ Marie Petersen, 'International Religious NGOs at The United Nations: A Study of a Group of Religious Organizations', *Journal of Humanitarian Assistance* (Nov 2010), available online at <https://sites.tufts.edu/jha/archives/847> (accessed 2016-01-19); Katherine Marshall, 'Faith, Religion, and International Development', in *The Oxford Handbook of Christianity and Economics*, edited by Paul Oslington (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), pp. 384-400; Putnam and Campbell; Robert Woodberry, 'Pentecostalism and Democracy', in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant, and Richard Flory (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 119-137.

networking events and workshops for local groups and individuals involved in social enterprise or planning to launch a business.

But trust is also stimulated by the EPCM propensity to establish and resource networks of professionals designed not only for mutual encouragement but to increase accountability and transparency in the workplace. It is in the moral energy, vision and commitment such networks embody that lies a key to the EPCM's social significance and hence its significance for development. More important than any physical resources the movement provides is its contribution to building cultures with robust norms and institutions that help release the poor to create new wealth for themselves, their families, and their communities.³⁵

This is of particular importance in countries with dysfunctional and ineffective governments, which are generally the countries in which the EPCM is the most vigorous. While the suggestion made by Micklethwait and Wooldridge may be too simplistic that religion flourishes in inverse proportion to the size of the welfare state, the failure of the state to build effective civil society provides the EPCM with an open opportunity to succeed where the state has failed.³⁶ Indeed, one of the attractions of the EPCM where states are failing is that it provides much needed social services that go well beyond what can be offered at its gatherings on Sundays. These are often funded through a system of tithing that acts as an additional, and often more effective, form of taxation. The EPCM operates in such contexts as an alternative to the state, its churches and voluntary associations creating, and helping to fill, the space between the individual and state. In doing so, such institutions act as mediating structures that resist political control because in nurturing 'habits of the heart' they promote civic and democratic freedom. The importance of this is highlighted by the fact that the constitutions most African countries received at independence are inadequate for addressing contemporary problems, in part because the role defined for government far outstrips its capacity to deliver and because citizens are not given adequate powers to hold their leaders to account.

The EPCM represents, in other words, a significant source of institutional, relational, moral and spiritual capital. It builds these forms of capital from the bottom up, often through the founding of new churches by entrepreneurial leaders. As these leaders

³⁵ Joy Kooi-Chin Tong, *Overseas Chinese Christian Entrepreneurs in Modern China: A Case Study of the Influence of Christian Ethics on Business Life* (London: Anthem, 2012); *Religion and Entrepreneurship*, edited by Léo-Paul Dana (Cheltenham: Edward Elgar, 2010), pp. 113-266; Niall Ferguson, *Civilization: The West and the Rest* (London: Allen Lane, 2011), pp. 256-294; Laura Nash and Scotty McLennan, *Church on Sunday, Work on Monday: The Challenge of Fusing Christian Values with Business Life* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2001); David Miller, *God at Work: The History and Promise of the Faith at Work Movement* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007). Dena Freeman writes that 'Pentecostals place a strong emphasis on moral purity and ethical behaviour. They refuse, in theory and often in practice, to give or receive bribes or to engage in other forms of corruption. They observe strict injunctions against stealing and lying, and place particular emphasis on honesty and reliability (...) [I]t is widely believed (...) that Pentecostals are in general more honest, trustworthy and hardworking than other people (Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', p. 14). This accords with the findings of research carried out by Peter S. Heslam and Eric A. S. Wood; see, for instance, 'Faith and Business Practice', and 'Greed is Good? An International Study of Christian Entrepreneurs', in *Business Ethics Today: The Sacred and the Market* (Basking Ridge, NJ: Center for Christian Business Ethics Today), 2015, pp. 25-61.

³⁶ John Micklethwait and Adrian Wooldridge, *God is Back: How the Global Rise of Faith is Changing the World* (London: Allen Lane, 2009), p. 150; Martin, *The Future of Christianity*.

need to compete for loyalty, rather than being able to rely on established privileges, they tend to stimulate (whether or not intentionally) local accountability. In turn this gives rise to a range of voluntary associations and civil society organizations that are reminiscent of Edmund Burke's famous 'little platoons' and function as moral or 'authoritative' communities. The emergence of such associational life helps reinforce positive behavioural changes and increases mutual accountability between citizens.

All this is a spontaneous, autonomous development, not dependent on governments, aid programmes, or NGOs. Often the social outreach occurs directly through the church, rather than through new or established faith-based organizations (FBOs) and other NGOs. Whatever the model used, the organizational infrastructure involved is not inconsiderable. But for the many people joining such an organic yet organized movement who live in situations of social disorder, the associated discipline provides a sense of stability and well-being. They feel greater freedom to pursue their aspirations in spite of the debilitating effects of the traditional value systems and steady-state economies that surround them.³⁷ While the Pentecostal worldview shares with many traditional indigenous worldviews a high regard for the miraculous, Pentecostalism in general seeks to break away from the practices and values of traditional magico-religious culture. It is not without irony that this is occurring at the same time that post-development theorists are seeking to base models for social change on these traditions. But the EPCM's insistence on personal spiritual transformation as the basis for social uplift transcends development and post-development theories and provides a unique framework and agenda for cultural renewal. The movement's stimulation of proactive, agency mindsets and behaviours encourages human development from the grassroots up, rather than through the more passive top-down models generally preferred by NGOs, governments and international development institutions. In keeping with its development orientation that eschews dependency in favour of self-help, the movement provides many development tools from within.

Indeed, the prevailing entrepreneurial culture of EPCM churches provides fertile ground for the incubation of attitudes and mindsets that are invaluable to the success of commercial enterprise. Often the vibrancy of this culture is stimulated and maintained by church leaders who are also business leaders and social entrepreneurs. They use their entrepreneurial skills as much in their business and social leadership as in their church leadership. This is reflected especially in the training programmes they provide that are designed to equip commercial and social entrepreneurs with sound biblical values, and church pastors with sound business skills. Such leaders form part of a growing global constituency sometimes referred to as 'pastorpreneurs', or (in the case of China) 'Boss Christians', who are dedicated not only to spiritual transformation but also to socio-

³⁷ Rebecca Samuel Shah and Timothy Samuel Shah, 'How Evangelicalism - Including Pentecostalism - Helps the Poor: The Role of Spiritual Capital', in *The Hidden Form of Capital: Spiritual Influences in Societal Progress*, edited by Peter Berger and Gordon Redding (London: Anthem, 2011), pp. 61-90; Heslam, 'Happiness Through Thrift', pp. 55-59; Martin, *The Future of Christianity*; Sherman. Dena Freeman writes that 'religious institutions are, of course, a key part of civil society, being the most prevalent form of associational life in Africa today' (Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', p. 2). In support she cites Paul Gifford's *Ghana's New Christianity: Pentecostalism in a Globalizing African Economy* (London: Hurst, 2004), p. 521. Freeman comes to the conclusion that 'Pentecostal churches are often rather more effective change agents than are development NGOs' (Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', p. 3).

cultural renewal. Young people growing up in the dynamic and highly entrepreneurial churches managed by such leaders often imbibe the innovative, relational, disciplined, resilient and risk-taking dispositions with which their churches have made them familiar. This stands them in good stead to be agents of socio-economic change when they more fully enter the world of work.³⁸

Lying at the heart of the EPCM's potential to build civil society are two distinctively religious motifs: worship and conversion. A far deeper matter than music style, worship is generally regarded amongst EPCM adherents not only as the foundation and expression of joy and hope but of human-divine encounter. It is understood to be a direct experience of the holy that not only takes precedence over routinized liturgies, dogmas and power structures but uplifts the individual, unites a community, and empowers it for service in the world. Such adherents would reject Emile Durkheim's reductionism about religion, whereby worship is only to be understood in purely human terms. But his less contestable observation that collective worship plays a powerful social role because it reinforces common values certainly applies to the EPCM.³⁹ This is especially the case because of the way the movement couples worship to work, sometimes with explicit reference to *avodah* (עבודָה), a word in the Hebrew scriptures that has a root with three closely related meanings: work, worship, and service. There is no place, consequently, for Weber's 'disenchantment of the world' in the movement's worldview. The same is true for the emphasis on conversion. Human beings, the EPCM maintains, need not only to turn from falsehoods to accept certain beliefs. They also need an internal transformation that realigns their moral compass and results in concrete and practical changes in lifestyle.⁴⁰ As these changes are to go beyond the domestic sphere into public life and the world of work, they are crucial in driving upward social mobility. Indeed, the key to the cultural impact of the EPCM is its ability to integrate the spiritual and the material in ways that reflect an holistic understanding of personhood and community. As it does so it challenges an aspect of the ideological architecture fundamental both to modernity and post-modernity: the division between sacred and secular.

³⁸ Peter S. Heslam, 'Boss Christians: Entrepreneurs in Asia's Spiritual and Economic Awakening', *Faith in Business Quarterly* 13:3 (2011), pp. 31-32; Peter S. Heslam, 'Christianity and the Prospects for Development', p. 367; Chen Cunfu and Huang Tianhai, 'The Emergence of a New Type of Christian in China Today', *Review of Religious Research* 40:2 (2004), pp. 183-200; John Jackson, *Pastorpreneur: Pastors and Entrepreneurs Answer the Call* (Friendswood, TX: Baxter, 2004); Ferguson, pp. 284-288; Nanlai Cao, *Constructing China's Jerusalem: Christians, Power and Place in Contemporary Wenzhou* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2011); McCain, p. 175.

³⁹ Emile Durkheim, *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1915).

⁴⁰ Dena Freeman maintains that the key to the development significance of Pentecostal churches lies in things secular NGOs tend to ignore, including personal transformation and empowerment; local accountability; participation; local funding; and the granting of moral legitimacy for 'a set of behaviour changes that would otherwise clash with local values'. Such churches 'radically reconstruct families and communities to support these new values and new behaviours' (Freeman, 'Pentecostal Ethic', pp. 3, 24-26). While there is a general consensus amongst scholars of Pentecostalism that personal transformation is central to the movement, the sociological terminology used varies considerably and includes 'change in subjectivity', 'revision of consciousness', 'remaking of the individual', 'reorientation of persons', 'modality transformation', and 'breaking' (with the past).

Although this does not mean that the EPCM in general aspires to organized political representation, the movement's impact on civil society ensures its public significance. Indeed, the widespread convergence of the EPCM and entrepreneurial economic activity appears to bring attitudinal and behavioural shifts that increase pressure for democratic governance and accountability because they are centred around personhood, community, personal transformation, initiative and accountability. In maintaining this pressure, the EPCM is able to draw on greater human and intellectual resources than other social institutions. Concrete democratic change is not, however, an inevitable result. As regimes in all too many developing countries demonstrate, unaccountable elites with vested interests can use the police and military to suppress democratic change. But the demand for change grows as the EPCM stimulates enterprise, advocates for civil liberties, defies entrenched hierarchies, stimulates democratic habits, and nurtures the kind of moral-cultural milieu that is conducive to entrepreneurial and democratic capitalism. This is reflected in Peter Berger's argument that 'capitalism is a necessary but not sufficient condition of democracy',⁴¹ although it is personal transformation, not capitalism and democracy per se, that are for the EPCM the building blocks of the economic and public spheres. Indeed, the EPCM vision of social revolution is focused unrelentingly at the micro-level of personhood and community, reflected in such seemingly small steps as a fresh convert living in an economically deprived area participating in a workshop on book-keeping, or on how to start a business. However elaborate its social outreach, innovation and advocacy, it is only in maintaining this grassroots focus that the movement sustains hope of changing the world.

Conclusion

The scientific study of the socio-economic impact of religious belief, though still embryonic, has developed a great deal since Weber's time. The data and tools available to contemporary researchers are so superior to those available to him that many of his findings can now be seen to be dubious. The key to his genius lies, however, with his asking of the question how, at a fundamental level, faith shapes economic culture. Over a century later, the world has become more culturally and technologically interconnected and more capitalist than he could have imagined. But in doing so, contrary to the logic of his arguments, and those of subsequent generations of sociologists, it has not become more secular. Wherever the balance lies between causation, correlation and mere concurrence in the simultaneous rise of religion and capitalism today, Weber's question needs to be posed again, with the focus this time being on the world's developing and emerging regions.

In doing so, the EPCM ought not to be dismissed as synonymous to the prosperity gospel, or for being behind the times on social and ethical issues surrounding sexuality and gender. Such dismissal only compounds the reasons why religion has been overlooked, both in the study of development and in the post-development search for 'alternatives to development'. The EPCM acts in many ways as a progressive force, such as in its support for welfare, education, technological innovation, social and commercial

⁴¹ Peter Berger, *The Capitalism Revolution: Fifty Propositions about Prosperity, Equality and Liberty* (New York: Basic Books, 1986), p. 81.

enterprise, advocacy and affirmative action, and the empowerment of women. The old adage goes 'give a poor person a fish and they will eat for a day but teach them to fish and they will eat for a lifetime'. In the case of the EPCM, however, it is as if the following line needs to be added: 'Help that person set up a fish processing and export enterprise that embodies good ethics and their entire community will benefit'. While this would be more demanding than giving a fish, or teaching to fish, it would embody the self-help, community-minded pro-trust mindset and *modus operandi* of the EPCM, which are well disposed to comprehend the potentially higher and more sustainable social returns involved.

At its best, the movement is helping ordinary people experience extraordinary change in their personal lives and in their communities. In doing so, it shuns victimhood and entitlement mentalities, and the seeking of special privileges, in favour of good stewardship, accountability, and integrity. Such change has helped millions of people trapped in poverty to break loose, improve their standard of living, contribute to civil society and gain a sense of optimism, dignity and self-worth. This in turn has increased their collective social conscience and their participation in affairs that affect the livelihoods of others. The result has not only been an increase in financial capital but also in spiritual, moral, relational and institutional capital. While these forms of capital may be harder to quantify, they are crucial to human wellbeing, reflecting the fact that development is not primarily about *having* but about *being*. As the EPCM helps build capital in its various forms, it holds out the hope that in faith-driven human development for the common good lies one of the futures of capitalism.

Peter S. Heslam, University of Cambridge
psh20@cam.ac.uk

Bibliography

- Asmus, Barry and Wayne Grudem. *The Poverty of Nations: A Sustainable Solution*. Wheaton: Crossway, 2013.
- Balia, Daryl. *Make Corruption History*. London: SPCK, 2009.
- Banerjee, Abhijit V. and Esther Duflo. *Poor Economics: Barefoot Hedge-fund Managers, DIY Doctors and the Surprising Truth about Life on Less than \$1 a Day*. London: Penguin, 2011.
- Barro, Robert J. and Rachel M. McCleary. 'Religion and Economic Growth across Countries', *American Sociological Review* (2003), pp. 760-781.
- Berger, Peter. *The Capitalism Revolution: Fifty Propositions about Prosperity, Equality and Liberty*. New York: Basic Books, 1986.
- Berger, Peter. *Faith and Development: A Global Perspective*. Public lecture delivered at the Centre for Development and Enterprise (CDE) in Johannesburg (Johannesburg: CDE, 2008). Online at: http://www.cde.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2013/02/Faith_and_Development.pdf (accessed 2016-01-19).
- Berger, Peter. 'Max Weber is alive and well and living in Guatemala'. Paper prepared for the conference 'The Norms, Beliefs and Institutions of the Twenty-First Century' at Cornell University (Ithaca, New York), 8-9 October 2004.
- Bernstein, Ann. *The Case for Business in Developing Economies*. London: Penguin, 2010.

- Bernstein, Ann and Stephen Rule. 'Flying under South Africa's Radar: The Growth and Impact of Pentecostals in a Developing Country', in *The Hidden Form of Capital: Spiritual Influences in Societal Progress*, edited by Peter Berger and Gordon Redding. London: Anthem, 2011, pp. 91-131.
- Bhagwati, Jagdish. *In Defence of Globalization*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Bishop, Matthew and Michael Green. *Philanthrocapitalism: How Giving Can Save the World*. London: A&C Black, 2010.
- Bradley, Anne and Art Lindsay (Eds), *For the Least of These: A Biblical Answer to Poverty*. Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2015.
- Brennan, Kathleen and Andrew London. 'Are Religious People Nice People? Religiosity, Race, Interview Dynamics and Perceived Cooperativeness', *Sociological Inquiry* 71:2 (2001), pp. 129-144.
- Brusco, Elizabeth. *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Columbia*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995.
- Cadge, Wendy and Robert Wuthnow. 'Religion and the Non-Profit Sector', in *The Nonprofit Sector: A Research Handbook*, 2nd edition, edited by Walter Powell and Richard Steinberg. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2006, pp. 485-505.
- Calderisi, Robert. *The Trouble with Africa: Why Foreign Aid Isn't Working*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- Cao, Nanlai. *Constructing China's Jerusalem: Christians, Power and Place in Contemporary Wenzhou*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2011.
- Collier, Paul. *The Bottom Billion: Why the Poorest Countries are Failing and What Can be Done About It*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Corbett, Steve and Brian Fikkert. *When Helping Hurts: Alleviating Poverty Without Hurting the Poor and Yourself*. Chicago: Moody Press, 2009.
- Cunfu, Chen and Huang Tianhai. 'The Emergence of a New Type of Christian in China Today', *Review of Religious Research* 40:2 (2004), pp. 183-200.
- Dana, Léo-Paul. *Entrepreneurship and Religion*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar, 2010.
- Davis, Mike. 'Planet of Slums: Urban Involution and the Informal Proletariat', *New Left Review* 26 (2004), pp. 5-34.
- Deneulin, Severine. *Religion in Development: Rewriting the Secular Script*. London: Zed, 2009.
- Deneulin, Severine and Carole Rakodi. 'Revisiting Religion: Development Studies Thirty Years On', *World Development* 39:1 (2011), pp. 45-54.
- Durkheim, Emile. *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life*. London: Allen & Unwin, 1915.
- Easterly, William. *The White Man's Burden: Why the West's Efforts to Aid the Rest Have Done so Much Ill and so Little Good*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Fairbanks, Michael, Malik Fal, Marcela Escobari-Rose and Elizabeth Hooper (Eds). *In the River they Swim: Essays from Around the World on Enterprise Solutions to Poverty*. West Conshohocken: Templeton, 2009.
- Feldmann, Horst. 'Protestantism, Labor Force Participation, and Employment Across Countries', *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 66:4 (2007), pp. 795-816.
- Ferguson, Niall. *Civilization: The West and the Rest*. London: Allen Lane, 2011.
- Freeman, Dena (Ed). *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
- Freeman, Dena. 'The Pentecostal Ethic and the Spirit of Development', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012, pp. 1-38.

- Freston, Paul. 'Pentecostals and Politics in Latin America', in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant, and Richard Flory. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013, pp. 101-118.
- Fukuyama, Francis. *Trust: The Social Virtues and the Creation of Prosperity*. New York: Free Press, 1995.
- Gifford, Paul. *Ghana's New Christianity: Pentecostalism in a Globalizing African Economy*. London: Hurst, 2004.
- Greeley, Andrew. 'Coleman Revisited: Religious Structures as a Source of Social Capital', *American Behavioral Scientist* 40:5 (1997), pp. 587-594.
- Grim, Brian J. and Roger Finke. *The Price of Freedom Denied: Religious Persecution and Conflict in the Twenty-First Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.
- Grier, Robin. 'The Effect of Religion on Economic Development: A Cross National Study of 63 Former Colonies', *Kyklos* 50:1 (1997), pp. 47-61.
- Guiso, Luigi, Paola Sapienza and Luigi Zingales. "'People's Opium?' Religion and Economic Attitudes", *Journal of Monetary Economics* 50 (2003), pp. 225-282.
- Harrison, Lawrence. *Who Prospers? How Cultural Values Shape Economic and Political Success*. New York: Basic Books, 1992.
- Harrison, Lawrence. *The Central Liberal Truth: How Politics can Change a Culture and Save it from Itself*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Helgesson, Kristina. *Walking in the Spirit: The Complexity of Belonging in Two Pentecostal Churches in Durban, South Africa*. Uppsala: Elanders, 2006.
- Henley, Andrew. 'Is Religion Associated with Entrepreneurial Activity?' IZA Discussion Paper No. 8111 (April 2014). Online at: <http://ftp.iza.org/dp8111.pdf> (accessed 2016-01-19).
- Heslam, Peter S. 'Boss Christians: Entrepreneurs in Asia's Spiritual and Economic Awakening', *Faith in Business Quarterly* 13:3 (2011), pp. 31-32.
- Heslam, Peter S. 'Christianity and the Prospects for Development in the Global South', in *The Oxford Handbook of Christianity and Economics*, edited by Paul Oslington. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014, pp. 359-383.
- Heslam, Peter S. and Eric Wood. 'Greed is Good? An International Study of Christian Entrepreneurs', in *Business Ethics Today: The Sacred and the Market*. Basking Ridge, NJ: Center for Christian Business Ethics Today, 2015, pp. 25-61.
- Heslam, Peter S. 'Happiness Through Thrift: The Contribution of Business to Human Wellbeing', in *The Practices of Happiness: Political Economy, Religion, and Wellbeing*, edited by John Atherton, Elaine Graham and Ian Steedman. London: Routledge, 2011, pp. 54-65.
- Heslam, Peter S. 'The Role of Business in the Fight Against Poverty', in *Christian Theology and Market Economics*, edited by Ian R. Harper and Samuel Gregg. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar, 2008, pp. 164-180.
- Heslam, Peter S. *Transforming Capitalism: Entrepreneurship and the Renewal of Thrift*. Cambridge: Grove, 2011.
- Heslam, Peter S. and Eric Wood. 'Faith and Business Practice amongst Christian Entrepreneurs in Developing and Emerging Markets', *Koers - Bulletin for Christian Scholarship* 79:2 (2014). Online at: <http://www.journals.koers.aosis.co.za/index.php/koers/article/viewFile/2131/2464> (accessed 2016-01-19).
- Heslam, Peter S., Michael G. Pollitt and Ian W. Jones. *How a Social Capital Approach can help Multinationals to Show Ethical Leadership*, Working Paper 388. Cambridge: Centre for Business Research, University of Cambridge, 2009.

- Jackson, John. *Pastorpreneur: Pastors and Entrepreneurs Answer the Call*. Friendswood, TX: Baxter, 2004.
- Johnson, Bryon, Ralph Tompkins and Derek Webb. *Objective Hope: Assessing the Effectiveness of Faith-Based Organizations: A Review of the Literature*. Waco, TX: Baylor Institute for Studies of Religion, 2008.
- Jones, Ben. 'Pentecostalism, Development NGOs and Meaning in Eastern Uganda', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*, edited by Dena Freeman. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012, pp. 181-202.
- De Jong, Eelke. 'Religious Values and Economic Growth: A Review and Assessment of Recent Studies', Working Paper 08-111, November 2008, Nijmegen Center for Economics, Institute for Management Research, Radboud University Nijmegen.
- Kakwani, Nanak and Jacques Silber (Eds). *The Many Dimensions of Poverty*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- Karlan, Dean and Jacob Appel. *More Than Good Intentions: Improving the Ways the World's Poor Borrow, Save, Farm, Learn, and Stay Healthy*. New York: Penguin, 2011.
- Khanna, Tarun. *Billions of Entrepreneurs: How China and India are Reshaping Their Futures and Ours*. Boston, MA: Harvard Business School Press, 2007.
- Knack, Stephen and Philip Keefer. 'Does Social Capital Have an Economic Payoff? A Cross-Country Investigation', *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 112 (1997), pp. 1251-1288.
- Lam, Pui-Yan. 'As the Flocks Gather: How Religion Affects Voluntary Association Participation', *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 41:3 (2002), pp. 405-422.
- Lewis, Donald. *Christianity Reborn: The Global Expansion of Evangelicalism in the Twentieth Century*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2004.
- Marshall, Katherine. 'Faith, Religion, and International Development', in *The Oxford Handbook of Christianity and Economics*, edited by Paul Oslington. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014, pp. 384-400.
- Marshall, Katherine and Marisa Van Saanen. *Development and Faith: Where Mind, Heart, and Soul Work Together*. Washington: World Bank, 2007.
- Marshall, Ruth. 'Power in the Name of Jesus', *Review of African Political Economy* 52 (1991), pp. 21-37.
- Martin, Bernice. 'The Pentecostal Gender Paradox: A Cautionary Tale for the Sociology of Religion', in *The Blackwell Companion to the Sociology of Religion*, edited by Richard Fenn. Oxford: Blackwell, 2001, pp. 52-66.
- Martin, David. *The Future of Christianity: Reflections on Violence and Democracy, Religion and Secularization*. Farnham: Ashgate, 2011.
- Martin, David. *On Secularization: Towards a Revised General Theory*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005.
- Maxwell, David. "'Delivered from the Spirit of Poverty": Pentecostalism, Prosperity and Modernity in Zimbabwe', *Journal of Religion in Africa* 28:3 (1998), pp. 350-373.
- McCain, Danny. 'The Metamorphosis of Nigerian Pentecostalism: From Signs and Wonders in the Church to Service and Influence in the World', in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant and Richard Flory. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013, pp. 160-181.
- Micklethwait, John and Adrian Wooldridge, *God is Back: How the Global Rise of Faith is Changing the World*. London: Allen Lane, 2009.
- Miller, David. *God at Work: The History and Promise of the Faith at Work Movement*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.

- Miller, Donald. 'Introduction: Pentecostalism as a Global Phenomenon', in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant and Richard Flory. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003, pp. 1-19.
- Miller, Donald and Tetsunao Yamamori. *Global Pentecostalism: The New Face of Christian Social Engagement*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.
- Moyo, Dambisa. *Dead Aid: Destroying the Biggest Global Myth of Our Time*. London: Allen Lane, 2008.
- Narayan, Deepa. 'Voices of the Poor', *Faith in Development: Partnership between the World Bank and the Churches of Africa*, edited by Deryke Belshaw, Robert Calderisi and Chris Sugden. Oxford: Regnum, 2001, pp. 39-48.
- Nash, Laura and Scotty McLennan. *Church on Sunday, Work on Monday: The Challenge of Fusing Christian Values with Business Life*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2001.
- Parsitau, Damaris. 'Agents of Gendered Change: Empowerment, Salvation and Gendered Transformation in Urban Kenya', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*, edited by Dena Freeman. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012, pp. 203-221.
- Perry, Alex. *The Rift: A New Africa Breaks Free*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 2015.
- Petersen, Marie. 'International Religious NGOs at The United Nations: A Study of a Group of Religious Organizations', *Journal of Humanitarian Assistance* (Nov 2010). Online at: <https://sites.tufts.edu/jha/archives/847> (accessed 2016-01-19).
- Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life. *Global Christianity: A Report on the Size and Distribution of the World's Christian Population*. Washington, DC: Pew Forum, 2011.
- Putnam, Robert. *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2000.
- Putnam, Robert and David Campbell. *American Grace: How Religion Divides and Unites Us*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010.
- Riddell, Roger C. *Does Foreign Aid Really Work?* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Sachs, Jeffrey. *The End of Poverty: How we can make it happen in our lifetime*. London: Penguin, 2005.
- Schlemmer, Lawrence. *Dormant Capital: The Pentecostal Movement in South Africa and its Potential Social and Economic Role*. Johannesburg: Centre for Development and Enterprise, 2008.
- Sen, Amartya. *Development as Freedom*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Shah, Rebecca Samuel and Timothy Samuel Shah. 'How Evangelicalism - Including Pentecostalism - Helps the Poor: The Role of Spiritual Capital', in *The Hidden Form of Capital: Spiritual Influences in Societal Progress*, edited by Peter Berger and Gordon Redding. London: Anthem, 2011, pp. 61-90.
- Shao, John. 'Alleviating Poverty in Africa', in *Faith in Development: Partnership between the World Bank and the Churches of Africa*, edited by Deryke Belshaw, Robert Calderisi and Chris Sugden. Oxford: Regnum, 2001, pp. 19-30.
- Sherman, Amy. *The Soul of Development: Biblical Christianity and Economic Transformation in Guatemala*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Simon, David (Ed). *Fifty Key Thinkers on Development*. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2006.
- Smidt, Corwin E. (Ed), *Religion as Social Capital: Producing the Common Good*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2003.
- Soothill, Jane. *Gender, Social Change and Spiritual Power: Charismatic Christianity in Ghana*. Leiden: Brill, 2007.

- Stiglitz, Joseph. *Making Globalization Work: The Next Steps to Global Justice*. London: Allen Lane, 2006.
- Taylor, Michael. *Not Angels but Agencies: The Ecumenical Response to Poverty*. London: SCM, 2011.
- Toft, Monica Duffy, Daniel Philpott and Timothy Samuel Shah. *God's Century: Resurgent Religion and Global Politics*. New York: Norton, 2001.
- Tomalin, Emma. 'Faiths and Development', in *The Companion to Development Studies*, edited by Vandana Desai and Robert Potter. London: Hodder Arnold, 2008, pp. 485-489.
- Tong, Joy Kooi-Chin. *Overseas Chinese Christian Entrepreneurs in Modern China: A Case Study of the Influence of Christian Ethics on Business Life*. London: Anthem, 2012.
- van Dijk, Rijk. 'Religion, Reciprocity and Restructuring Family Responsibility in the Ghanaian Pentecostal Diaspora', in *The Transnational Family: New European Frontiers and Global Networks*, edited by Deborah Bryceson and Ulla Vuorela. Oxford: Berg, 2002, pp. 173-196.
- van Dijk, Rijk. 'Pentecostalism and Post-Development: Exploring Religion as a Developmental Ideology in Ghanaian Migrant Communities', in *Pentecostalism and Development: Churches, NGOs and Social Change in Africa*, edited by Dena Freeman. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012, pp. 87-108.
- Widmer, Andreas. 'Ministering to the Pioneers of Prosperity', in *Free Markets and the Culture of the Common Good*, edited by Martin Schlag and Juan Andrés Mercado. London: Springer, 2012, pp. 167-176.
- Wilson, Craig and Peter Wilson. *Make Poverty Business: Increase Profits and Reduce Risks by Engaging with the Poor*. Sheffield: Greenleaf, 2006.
- Woodberry, Robert. 'Pentecostalism and Democracy', in *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism*, edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant and Richard Flory. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013, pp. 119-137.
- World Economic Forum. *Results of the Survey on Trust*. Davos: World Economic Forum, 2002.
- Weber, Max. *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. London: George Allen and Unwin, 1930 [1905].
- Young, Stephen. *Moral Capitalism: Reconciling Private Capitalism with the Public Good*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler, 2003.
- Zafirovski, Milan. *Exchange, Action, and Social Structure: Elements of Economic Sociology*. Westport: Greenwood Press, 2001.
- Ziai, Aram (Ed). *Exploring Post-Development: Theory and Practice, Problems and Perspectives*. London: Routledge, 2007.